

## Message Text

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 01 NEW DE 06070 01 OF 02 061440Z

43

ACTION HEW-04

INFO OCT-01 NEA-09 IO-10 ISO-00 OES-03 AID-05 NSF-01 SMI-01

EB-07 CIAE-00 INR-07 NSAE-00 L-02 ABF-01 TRSE-00

OMB-01 /052 W

----- 038188

P 061320Z MAY 75

FM AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI

TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 8536

INFO USMISSION GENEVA PRIORITY

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE SECTION 1 OF 2 NEW DELHI 6070

DEPARTMENT PASS TO DHEW/PHS-OIH DR. PAUL EHRLICH

E.O. 11652: N/A

TAGS: TBIO, IN

SUBJ: US AND WHO AGAIN LINKED WITH GERM WARFARE ACTIVITIES  
IN INDIA

REFS: A. NEW DELHI 100039, 7/29/74

B. NEW DELHI 10111, 7/30/74

C. NEW DELHI 10112, 7/30/74

D. NEW DELHI 10131, 7/31/74

E. NEW DELHI 10194, 8/6/74

F. NEW DELHI 10544, 8/8/74

G. NEW DELHI MDVCON, 4/1/75 ON "GENETIC CONTROL OF  
MOSQUITOES."

H. DELHI'S 5849, 5/1/75

BEGIN SUMMARY. MOST OF THE NEW DELHI ENGLISH SPEAKING PRESS  
CARRIED ARTICLES MAY 1 AND OVER THE WEEKEND ON A REPORT SUBMITTED  
BY THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE OF THE LOK SABHA EXPRESSING  
CONCERN AT THE WAY FOREIGN-FINANCED SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH  
PROJECTS WERE BEING OPERATED. IT CALLED FOR A HIGH-LEVEL  
COORDINATED REVIEW OF THE PROJECTS FOR SECURITY REASONS  
LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 02 NEW DE 06070 01 OF 02 061440Z

BEFORE THEY ARE APPROVED BY THE GOI. THE REPORT PARTICULARLY

ATTACKED THE WHO-ICMR MOSQUITO GENETIC PROJECT SUPPORTED BY THE UNITED STATES PUBLIC HEALTH SERVICE (USPHS) AND REPRIMANDED THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH (MOH) AND THE INDIAN COUNCIL FOR MEDICAL RESEARCH (ICMR) FOR THEIR LOOSE WAY OF HANDLING THIS PROJECT. THE CONTRETEMPS MAY HAVE SOME SIGNIFICANT IMPLICATIONS FOR THE US SHOULD THE MINISTER OF HEALTH NOT STAND BY HIS EARLIER WHITE PAPER. IF HE BOWS TO THE PAC, WE WILL HAVE TO CLARIFY WITH THE GOI THE PARAMETERS WITHIN WHICH SCIENTIFIC COOPERATION CAN CONTINUE IF THE GOI IS NOT PREPARED TO DEFEND JOINT SCIENTIFIC PROGRAMS IT HAS SANCTIONED. (END SUMMARY)

1. A REPORT ENTITLED "FOREIGN PARTICIPATION OR COLLABORATION IN RESEARCH PROJECTS IN INDIA" WAS PLACED ON THE TABLE OF THE LOK SABHA ON APRIL 30 BY THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (PAC) CHAIRMAN, IUR. JYOTIRMOY BOSU. (BOSU IS A MEMBER OF THE COMMUNIST PARTY OF INDIA (CPI MARXIST) AND HAS BEEN HIGHLY CRITICAL IN THE PAST OF SCIENTIFIC COOPERATION WITH THE US.) THE PAC REPORT WAS PREPARED, AFTER THE PRESS TRUST OF INDIA (PTI) ARTICLES OF JULY AND AUGUST 1974, CONCERNING SEVERAL FOREIGN FINANCED PROJECTS IN INDIA, INCLUDING THE WHO-ICMR PROJECT ON GENETIC CONTROL OF MOSQUITOES, THE BOMBAY NATURAL HISTORY SOCIETY'S BIRD MIGRATION AND ARBOVIRUS STUDIES, ORIGINALLY SUPPORTED BY THE US AIR FORCE AND LATER BY WHO AND THE SMITHSONIAN INSTITUTION, A PROJECT ON THE ULTRA LOW VOLUME SPRAYING OF MOSQUITOES AT JODHPUR AND A MICROBIAL PESTICIDE RESEARCH PROJECT AT PANTNAGAR SPONSORED BY THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE (USDA).

2. THE PTI ARTICLES ORIGINALLY CLAIMED THAT SOME OF THESE PROJECTS WERE CAUSING CONCERN AMONG SCIENTISTS BECAUSE OF THEIR LOW PRIORITY TO INDIAN PUBLIC HEALTH AND THEIR POTENTIAL FOR GATHERING INFORMATION FOR BIOLOGICAL WAREFARE BY OUTSIDE AGENCIES. THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT STATES THAT, AFTER EXAMINATION OF HUGE AMOUNTS OF MATERIAL MADE AVAILABLE BOTH BY THE HEALTH MINISTRY AND THE PTI, THE COMMITTEE FOUND THE "ARTICLES WERE NOT A FIGMENT OF IMAGINATION, BUT THE RESULT OF PAINSTAKING RESEARCH AND INTENSIVE STUDY OF AUTHORITATIVE PUBLISHED WORKS, REPORTS, ETC." THE COMMITTEE REPORT CRITICIZES THE HEALTH MINISTRY AND ITS LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 03 NEW DE 06070 01 OF 02 061440Z

OFFICIALS FOR THE MANNER IN WHICH THEY DEALT WITH THIS PROJECT SAYING IT WAS "TANTAMOUNT TO LOCKING THE STABLE AFTER THE HORSE HAS BEEN STOLEN."

3. THE PAC EXPRESSED ITS CONCERN AT THE WAY INDIA HAD BEEN CHOSEN BY OTHER COUNTRIES FOR EXPERIMENTS "THAT HAVE A VITAL BEARING ON BIOLOGICAL WAREFARE." THE PAC REPORT FURTHER RECOMM-

ENDED THAT THE GOVERNMENT SHOULD CREATE A HIGH LEVEL COMMITTEE  
HEADED BY THE SCIENTIFIC ADVISOR TO THE DEFENCE MINISTRY  
AND INCLUDING HIGH SECURITY AGENCIES ON THE GOVERNMENT TO  
REVIEW, FROM THE STANDPOINT OF SECURITY, SCIENTIFIC AND OTHER  
RESEARCH PROJECTS. MEANWHILE, THE COMMITTEE FEELS THAT THE  
PROJECT OF GENETIC CONTROL OF MOSQUITOES SHOULD NOT BE  
RENEWED WHEN THE AGREEMENT EXPIRES ON JUNE 30, 1975.

4. THE REPORT SUGGESTED THAT THE FOLLOWING FIELDS OF  
ACTIVITY SHOULD COME UNDER THE NEW REVIEW COMMITTEE:  
OCEANOGRAPHY AND CONNECTED AREAS, METEOROLOGY AND  
WEATHER MODIFICATION, REMOTE SENSING FOR NATURAL  
RESOURCES, MICROBIOLOGY, EPIDEMIOLOGY, ECOLOGY AND VIROLOGY,  
TOXICOLOGY, PROPAGATION OF RADIO WAVES  
INCLUDING THEIR BEHAVIOR  
IN THE IONOSPHERE AND ATMOSPHERE  
LAYERS OVER THE COUNTRY, AND SCIENTIFIC INVESTIGATIONS IN  
BORDER AREAS SUCH AS HIMALAYAN GEOLOGY.

5. THE COMMITTEE REPORT WENT ON TO EXPRESS THE VIEW THAT  
"THE ENTIRE MOSQUITO GENETIC CONTROL PROJECT HAD BEEN ILL-  
CONCEIVED AND HAS NO UTILITY WHATSOEVER TO INDIA. THE  
BENEFITS, IF ANY TO INDIA, ARE NOT IMMEDIATE, BUT ONLY  
POTENTIAL. ON THE CONTRARY, THE PROJECT IS OF FAR GREATER  
IMPORTANCE TO ANY COUNTRY WHICH MIGHT WANT TO DEVELOP AN  
EFFECTIVE BIOLOGICAL WARFARE SYSTEM."

6. THE COMMITTEE REPORT ALSO NOTES THAT EVEN BEFORE PROPOSALS  
FOR EXTENDING THE GENETIC CONTROL OF MOSQUITOES PROJECT  
BEYOND JUNE 30, 1975 HAD BEEN INITIATED, THE US  
GOVERNMENT AND WHO HAD ALREADY SIGNED AN AGREEMENT AS EARLY AS  
JUNE 20, 1974, FOR EXTENDING THE PROJECT UP TO JUNE 30, 1978,  
BUT THIS FACT WAS "NOT EVEN KNOWN TO THE HEALTH SECRETARY."  
LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 04 NEW DE 06070 01 OF 02 061440Z

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

NNN

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 01 NEW DE 06070 02 OF 02 061834Z

43

ACTION HEW-04

INFO OCT-01 NEA-09 IO-10 ISO-00 OES-03 AID-05 NSF-01 SMI-01

EB-07 CIAE-00 INR-07 NSAE-00 L-02 ABF-01 TRSE-00

OMB-01 /052 W

----- 041064

P 061320Z MAY 75

FM AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI

TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 8537

INFO USMISSION GENEVA PRIORITY

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE SECTION 2 OF 2 NEW DELHI 6070

DEPT PASS TO DHEW/PHS-OIH DR. PAUL EHRLICH

7. THE REPORT STATED THAT "THIS WOULD ONLY INDICATE THE ANXIETY ON THE PART OF THE US GOVERNMENT TO CONTINUE THE PROJECT BEYOND JUNE 1975. THE QUESTION THAT ARISES IS: WHAT COULD HAVE PROMPTED THE US GOVERNMENT TO EXTEND THE PROJECT ON THEIR OWN?"

8. THE REPORT GOES ON TO STATE THAT THE SELECTION OF DELHI AS THE SITE FOR FIELD STUDIES ON THE CULEX FATIGAN MOSQUITOES WAS "SHROUDED IN MYSTERY" AND THE REASONS TOLD TO THE PAC WERE AT BEST "HYPOTHETICAL AND OBSCURE" BUT NOT "CONVINCING." IF THE GENETIC CONTROL PROJECT WAS REALLY JUSTIFIED, THE COMMITTEE REPORT WENT ON TO SAY, "THE HIGHEST PRIORITY SHOULD HAVE BEEN ACCORDED TO THE WORK ON MALARIAL MOSQUITOES."

9. COMMENTS: THE ORIGIN OF THE PAC REPORT DATES BACK TO THE SUMMER OF 1974 WHEN A JUNIOR LEFT-LEANING PRESS TRUST OF INDIA REPORTER WAS NOT GIVEN A SATISFACTORY INTERVIEW BY THE DIRECTOR GENERAL OF ICMR, AND ATTEMPTED TO CREATE A STORY OF INTRIGUE AND MYSTERY ABOUT GERM WARFARE AND FOREIGN INFLUENCE. HE WAS BACKED UP BY THE LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 02 NEW DE 06070 02 OF 02 061834Z

EDITOR OF THE PTI WHO IS ALSO PRO-COMMUNIST. THIS WAS READILY PICKED UP BY MR. JYOTIRMOY BOSU CHAIRMAN OF THE CPM (MARXIST) AND AT THAT TIME CHAIRMAN OF THE PAC. MANY HEARINGS WERE HELD DURING THE FALL AND WINTER WITH MOH AND ICMR OFFICIALS PRIMARILY CONCERNING THE WHO/ICMR RESEARCH PROJECT ON GENETIC CONTROL OF MOSQUITOES SUPPORTED BY THE WHO AND THE CENTER FOR DISEASE CONTROL, USPHS. THIS OFFERED AN OPPORTUNITY FOR BASU AND OTHER LEFTISTS IN PARLIAMENT TO MALIGN INDO-US COOPERATION AND INDIRECTLY

US POLICIES. THIS WAS PART OF AN OVERALL MOVEMENT AT THAT TIME BEFORE AND AFTER SECRETARY KISSINGER'S VISIT TO EMBARRASS THE GOVERNMENT. IT MATTERED NOT WHETHER THE PTI STORIES HAD ANY SUBSTANCE OR WHETHER THE REPORTS WERE SATISFACTORILY REBUKED BY THE ICMR AND MOH OFFICIALS.

10. A WHITE PAPER WAS PRODUCED IN DECEMBER BY THE MOH, WHICH MINISTRY OFFICERS FELT HAD ANSWERED ALL OF THE QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE PAC. THIS NEW POLICY ESTABLISHED A COMMITTEE WITHIN THE ICMR TO OVERSEE THE MOSQUITO PROJECT, PLACING ICMR IN FULL CONTROL OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE PROJECT.

11. THE RESEARCH AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CENTER FOR DISEASE CONTROL/PUBLIC HEALTH SERVICE (CDC/PHS) AND THE WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION (WHO), EXTENDING THE PROJECT FIVE YEARS BEYOND THE TERMINATION DATE OF JUNE 30, 1975, WAS SIGNED IN JUNE 1974 BY BOTH PARTIES. HOWEVER, THIS IS AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE WHO AND PHS DESCRIBING THE RESEARCH DESIGN OF THE PROJECT AND NEED NOT BE APPROVED BY THE GOI. THERE IS A SEPARATE AGREEMENT BETWEEN WHO AND THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH (MOH) FOR THE CONDUCT OF THIS PROJECT IN INDIA. THESE AGREEMENTS WILL TERMINATE AS OF JUNE 30, 1975, UNLESS RENEWED BY BOTH SIDES.

12. THE DIRECTOR GENERAL OF ICMR, DR. C. GOPALAN, TOLD THE SCIENCE ATTACHE THAT THE MOH IS STILL INTERESTED IN CONTINUING THE MOSQUITO GENETICS PROJECT WITH WHO AND US SUPPORT AND A DECISION WILL BE MADE BY THE MINISTER OF HEALTH IN THE NEAR FUTURE. MEANWHILE, WHO HAS SUFFICIENT FUNDS AVAILABLE TO CONTINUE THE PROJECT ANOTHER SIX MONTHS AFTER THE TERMINATION DATE OF JUNE 30, 1975. THIS SHOULD ALLOW LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 03 NEW DE 06070 02 OF 02 061834Z

TIME FOR THE AIR TO CLEAR AND THE REPORT TO BE FORGOTTEN BY THE PARLIAMENT. ACCORDING TO GOPALAN, THE MINISTRY WILL NOT ACT FURTHER ON THE REPORT SINCE THEY HAVE FURNISHED IN THE WHITE PAPER THE NECESSARY ANSWERS TO THE QUESTIONS.

13. THE MINISTER OF HEALTH, KARAN SINGH, WILL BE REPRESENTING INDIA AT THE WHO EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETINGS IN GENEVA FOR THE FIRST WEEK BEGINNING MAY 13. HE WILL RETURN TO DELHI ON MAY 17. THE HEALTH SECRETARY, GIAN PRAKASH, WILL ARRIVE ON MAY 18 TO HEAD THE INDIAN DELEGATION (SEE REFTEL 5849). THIS WILL OFFER THE OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THE WHOLE PROBLEM BETWEEN PERTINENT INDIAN WHO AND US OFFICIALS.

14. ALTHOUGH WE HAVE TAKEN A FAIR AMOUNT OF FLACK ON THIS WHOLE ISSUE, WE SEE THE CURRENT CONTRETEMPS AS PRIMARILY A

DISPUTE AMONG THE PAC AND THE INDIAN MOH, BUT ONE WITH POTENTIALLY SIGNIFICANT IMPLICATIONS FOR US. IF THE MINISTER OF HEALTH DOES NOT CHOOSE TO STAND BY HIS EARLIER WHITE PAPER, AND BOWS TO THE PAC, THEN THE LOSS OF THE MOSQUITO GENETIC PROJECT IS A SETBACK FOR THE GOI. BUT IT WILL ALSO BE A POTENTIAL SETBACK FOR INDO-US SCIENTIFIC COOPERATION SINCE WE BELIEVE WE WILL HAVE TO CLARIFY WITH THE GOI, POSSIBLY THROUGH THE INDO-US SUBCOMMISSION ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, THE PARAMETERS WITHIN WHICH SUCH COOPERATION CAN CONTINUE IF THE INDIAN GOVERNMENT IS NOT PREPARED TO DEFEND SCIENTIFIC PROGRAMS IT HAS SANCTIONED AND SCIENTISTS WITH WHOM IT HAS ENTHUSIASTICALLY COOPERATED. THE CONDUCT OF THE CONGRESS MEMBERS OF THE PAC IS CERTAINLY NO SATISFACTION TO THE MINISTER, BUT IN THE CONTEXT IT WOULD HAVE DEMANDED POLITICS OF A HIGHER ORDER THAN NORMALLY DISPLAYED FOR THE MAJORITY CONGRESS MEMBERS TO BLOCK THE PAC'S REPORT.

15. A COPY OF THE PAC REPORT IS BEING AIR POUCHED TODAY TO DR. EHRLICH.  
SAXBE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** RESEARCH, CHEMICAL WARFARE, PRESS COMMENTS, SCIENTIFIC COOPERATION, PROGRAMS (PROJECTS)  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 06 MAY 1975  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** ElyME  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1975NEWDE06070  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** N/A  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Film Number:** D750158-1012  
**From:** NEW DELHI  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1975/newtext/t19750577/aaaacssv.tel  
**Line Count:** 298  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Office:** ACTION HEW  
**Original Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 6  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** LIMITED OFFICIAL USE  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** 75 NEW DELHI 100039, 75 7/29/74  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** ElyME  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 23 JUN 2003  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <23 JUN 2003 by BoyleJA>; APPROVED <31 OCT 2003 by ElyME>  
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
05 JUL 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** US AND WHO AGAIN LINKED WITH GERM WARFARE ACTIVITIES IN INDIA  
**TAGS:** TBIO, IN, US, WHO  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 05 JUL 2006